

## FINAL EVALUATION

**KSV/010**

Strengthening vocational Training in Kosovo

### PROJECT SUMMARY DATA

Country	Kosovo
Long Project Title	Strengthening vocational Training In Kosovo
Short Project Title	Vocational Training in Kosovo
LuxDev Code	YUG/010
Final Version of the Report	February 2013

### RATING OF THE PROJECT BY THE EVALUATION MISSION

Global rating (Effectiveness)	<b>3</b> On a scale of 1 (excellent results, significantly better than expected) to 6 (the project was unsuccessful, or the situation has deteriorated on balance)
Rating using other evaluation criteria	Relevance: <b>1</b> Efficiency: <b>2</b> Sustainability: <b>3</b>

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### Mission objective

The mission's main objective was to undertake a final evaluation of project KSV/010, "Strengthening vocational Training in Kosovo". The evaluation was commissioned by Luxembourg Development Cooperation (LuxDev) and the contractor is INBAS GmbH. The project began in July 2006. A mid-term evaluation took place in 2009. The final evaluation fieldwork took place from 20 November to 6 December 2012.

The evaluation mission's terms of reference proposed that the evaluation be carried out by analysing the results reached at the time of the evaluation compared with what had been anticipated in the project document, the project's management and monitoring and the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability taking into account cross-cutting aspects.

The data was collected through individual interviews, workshop feedback and questionnaires along with a review of the documentation relating to the project.

### Specific Objective & Results

The specific objective of the project was to strengthen the capacity of public, private and not-for-profit sectors to provide pertinent vocational training in Kosovo.

The success of this objective depended on increasing the number of trainees, the distribution of trainees in favour of younger, more female and trainees from vulnerable groups either in terms of education/skill background or ethnicity. The overall number of trainees has remained static and the age of trainees has not changed much. The percentage of female trainees has increased from 33% to 46%. In terms of background while there has been a slight increase in those who are unskilled attending training there have also been increases in those with the highest qualifications attending training and the profile of the training population is significantly more highly qualified than the profile of the unemployed. In terms of ethnicity minority groups are underrepresented in comparison to their proportion in the population.

Further indicators required improvements in the quality of training, placement and expenditure. There has been an overall improvement in graduation rates which represents and proxy variable for quality. Two studies of placement present contradictory results. One estimates a placement rate of 40% and another of 23% for the same area. It is argued that the sampling method adopted in the first study biased the result upwards. Government expenditure on training declined in 2009, increased in 2010 and 2011 with a slight decline in 2012. It is estimated to be 1 400 000 EUR in 2012.

Result 1 required that the response to adult training needs be made more efficient by the introduction of a performance management system, reviewing and developing curricula, expanding the private sector's role and measuring the project beneficiaries. While management training took place it did not result in a complete performance management system. Curriculum development has been one of the most successful parts of the project with 10 curricula developed. The development of private sector participation has been achieved by the development of a training centre, a training fund and on-the-job training schemes. It is estimated there were 18 789 beneficiaries, 3 473 direct and 15 316 indirect.

Result 2 required an increase in the accessibility to training by vulnerable groups. The principle initiative to increase accessibility to these groups was the development of mobile units in Dragash, Deçan and Gračanica. The usage of mobile units varied from 100% in Deçan to as low as 10% in Gračanica.

Result 3 involved enhancing the physical capacity of the Don Bosko Centre and the vocational training centres to provide quality vocational training for adults. Two training centres were built or renovated, Don Bosko (Private) and Peja vocational training centre (Public). Workshops were renovated in Peja, Ferizaj and Pristina and equipment supplied to all vocational training centres. A substantial portion of the project's resources has been devoted to improving and upgrading vocational education and training infrastructure.

Result 4 envisaged enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of the department of labour and employment of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. In order to reconcile and complement the different supports funded by other donors on capacity building for the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, the project implemented the following:

- training for employees within the vocational training centres and the regional employment centers in english language and information technology (European Computer Driving License) ;
- developing a vocational education and training strategy ;
- the makeover/re-branding of the regional employment centers with a client oriented refurbishing designed to achieve a unified identity to attract prospective users.

The vocational education and training strategy represents a partial fulfilment of the indicator an “improvement of administrative, planning and managerial staff capabilities”.

Result 5 specified strengthening the public employment services through counselling and labour market information system (including an information system of employment management). The reorganisation of the counselling system with one type of generic counsellor instead of a model with three specialist counsellors (career guidance, training and employment) has taken place. Under this result it was required that the information system of employment management be fully equipped and functioning and linked when possible and appropriate with the Kosovo labour market information website “KOS-ESTIA”. The project supplied some information and technology equipment but the lack of competencies at the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare to operate and manage the SIMP meant that KSV/010 suspended its support temporarily. Another indicator specified that the department of labour and employment staff were to be trained in the application of the upgraded information system. Field visits were made to all regional employment centers to do this. Two media campaigns were commissioned to raise public awareness of the regional employment centers and the vocational training centres under this result.

Governance for development was a principal objective and fundamental in the design. In terms of impact, improvements were achieved but not as much as was originally expected. Gender equality was a significant objective and the impact was also significant measured by the increase in the percentage of women being trained. Environment and climate change were not targeted.

## **Conclusions and recommendations**

Overall the expected increase in people going through vocational education and training programmes has not occurred and while there has been a shift in favour of women attending training there has not been a significant shift in favour of other vulnerable groups, i.e. young people, minority groups. The most obvious success is the improved physical capacity for training in terms of infrastructure and facilities and the development of curricula. While capacity building has taken place it was directed insufficiently at the higher strategic levels required to administer the vocational education and training system. The public employment services system has been transformed at the regional level, but it has not resulted in a greater transfer of applicants to the vocational education and training system despite the high level of unemployment in Kosovo. Two media campaigns resulted in a temporary increase in throughput, but they have not resolved the continuing problem of under use of training facilities.

The evaluation of the project from the client/beneficiary perspective rates the relevance of the project highly and they consider the physical investment in buildings and equipment the most effective part followed by skills training and the transformation of the public employment system. The development of a labour market information systems and performance management system were considered to be less successful. The project compares favourably to other projects in terms of its response to the immediate needs of the vocational education and training system.

Recommendations for the future can be grouped under strategic, operational and assessment of the vocational education and training system. Currently the strategic planning component has been completed. Revisions and updating the plan would benefit from a greater research input and quantification of targets based on research.

In the area of operational planning and implementation there has been very little translation of strategic objectives into operational plans and structures. The vocational education and training system at the central managerial level is under resourced and the human resources plan to rectify this shortage is necessary. The delays in developing management information systems and internet based labour market information portal and websites suggest a need for information technology training and development. A facilities plan has been proposed to expand the infrastructure, but under the current low capacity usage of the existing facilities it is difficult to see how it can be justified. The training fund requires major donor contributions to be sustainable. Under the heading of the external relations plan the designated unit responsible seems to be restricted to European Union projects. It needs to incorporate the full range of donors.

Research and development, where labour market information, which should provide the guiding intelligence for the entire vocational education and training system, is currently limited to recording historical achievements and is underdeveloped as a projection tool. The development of a labour market information system should be based on economic/sector analysis and projections of industry requirements. Curriculum development needs to be assigned as a central responsibility to ensure continuous updating and development of curricula.

Assessment exists in so far as the input and output of regional employment centres and the vocational training centres are recorded, but the investigation of new assessment strategies and identification of performance benchmarks for institutions, programmes and personnel is absent.